

Gülru Necipoğlu, Cemal Kafadar, and Cornell H. Fleischer (eds.). *Treasures of Knowledge: An Inventory of the Ottoman Palace Library (1502/3–1503/4)*. Brill: Leiden and Boston, 2019. xiv + 1080, viii + 430 pages. ISBN: 9789004402485.

*Cailah Jackson**

The publication of a primary textual source is always a matter of excitement for historians, as such a work affords access that has the potential to further open and even transform the field. When that source is also reproduced in high-quality facsimile, capably transliterated, and accompanied by numerous essays that examine and contextualize its contents and are authored by leading scholars, this is indeed a cause for celebration. This is certainly the case for the work presently under discussion. This comprehensive two-volume publication concerns an Arabic manuscript, of which only one surviving copy exists, that lists all of the books in the Ottoman palace library and in the private collection of the Ottoman rulers as of the early 16th century. Commissioned by Bayezid II (r. 886-918/1481-1512) and prepared by his royal librarian, ‘Aṭūfi (d. 948/1541), in 908/1502-1503, the manuscript was transcribed as a clean copy in 909/1503-1504. It remains housed in the Oriental Collection of the Library of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences, Budapest under the shelf mark MS Török F. 59. The text is a rare and extremely valuable insight into the contents of an Islamic royal library. MS Török F. 59 has been known to scholarship since its discovery by the foremost scholar of Ottoman books and libraries, İsmail Erünsal, who has discussed it in several works since 1988. Although its historical value was clear

* Salem and Bakr bin Ladin Junior Research Fellow, Oxford Centre for Islamic Studies; Junior Research Fellow, Wolfson College, University of Oxford. Correspondence: cailah.jackson@oxcis.ac.uk.

from the outset, the substantial scholarly undertaking required to appropriately examine and interpret its contents has only occurred more recently, spurred on by an interdisciplinary workshop held at Harvard University in 2014.

Volume I of the work contains 28 essays exploring the inventory, and titles listed therein, and discussing wider historical and intellectual contexts. Reflecting the topics represented in the inventory and the order in which 'Aṭūfi listed them, the chapters cover a wide array of fields that will be described in more detail below. Five detailed appendices follow these essays. These comprise lists of the manuscripts containing the seal of Bayezid II both within and external to the Topkapı Palace collection, color plates, and English translations of 'Aṭūfi's Ottoman Turkish and Arabic inventory prefaces. Volume II consists of a transliteration of the entirety of the text produced by Himmət Taşkömür and Hesna Ergun Taşkömür, as well as a facsimile of the manuscript.

The first three essays from Volume I, authored by the editors and lead project investigators, Gülru Necipoğlu, Cemal Kafadar, and Cornell H. Fleischer, set the scene for subsequent chapters by examining aspects of the contemporary intellectual landscape in detail. Necipoğlu's impressively broad-ranging opening chapter covers topics such as the library as an architectural space, the formation of the book collection from the reign of Murad II (r. 824-855/1421-1451, with interruption), the Inner Treasury and its separate registers, contemporary Palatine libraries, and the organization and classification of information in the inventory's prefaces. Kafadar's essay concerns Bayezid himself, his patronage and affiliations, and the crucial environment of Amasya, where the ruler had governed as a prince for nearly 30 years. The chapter also includes a list of manuscripts that are key to understanding how the inventory was assembled. The final contribution in this first overview section from Fleischer focuses on the wider context of the creation of an Ottoman imperial identity, particularly through the case study of 'Abd al-Raḥmān Bisṭāmī (d. 858/1454), a Sufi adherent of the science of letters, or lettrism (*'ilm al-ḥurūf*) and leading Ottoman intellectual figure.

The following three essays from Zeynep Atbaş, Zeren Tanındı, and Judith Pfeiffer respectively are grouped under the heading, "The Palace Library as a Collection and the Book Arts." Atbaş's chapter looks at illuminated and illustrated manuscripts and fine bindings in the Topkapı Palace collection (particularly those dedicated to Ottoman sultans) that bear Bayezid's distinctive almond-shaped seal. Tanındı's contribution focuses on similar subject matter but instead attempts to draw links between specific surviving manuscripts and those listed in the inventory. Both essays are

richly illustrated and will be a boon to art historians in particular. Pfeiffer's chapter engagingly discusses the contemporary and prodigious collection of the Ottoman scholar 'Abd al-Rahmān ibn 'Alī ibn Mu'ayyad, also known as Müeyyedzade (d. 922/1516), which itself had been inventoried soon after the bibliophile's death. The discussion of the relationship between the two collectors (Bayezid and Müeyyedzade) and their libraries provides a fascinating insight into Ottoman intellectual interests.

The rest of the volume's 22 chapters fall under the heading, "Book Titles and Their Disciplines in the Palace Library Inventory." As briefly mentioned above, these cover a wide range of subjects, and many scholars will find something of interest and relevance here. The first essay by Mohsen Goudarzi concerns books on *tafsīr* (exegesis) and *qirā'āt* (Qur'an recitation), while the second by Recep Gürkan Göktaş focuses on *ḥadīth*. Guy Burak's chapter looks at titles dealing with prayers, invocations, and lettrism, thereby complementing Fleischer's analysis. The next contribution by Abdurrahman Atçıl examines *kalām* (rational theology) while Himmet Taşkömür discusses books on Hanafī imams and substantive law (*furū' al-fiqh*). Taşkömür also includes an English translation of the preface to the 968/1560-1561 inventory of books given by Mehmed II (r. 848-886/1444-1481, with interruption) to his Istanbul mosque complex (now the Fatih collection in the Süleymaniye Library). The next essay by Mürteza Bedir also discusses jurisprudence but with a focus on legal theory (*uṣūl al-fiqh*).

In their introduction to the following chapter concerning Sufism, Cemal Kafadar and Ahmet Karamustafa note that this section "constitutes the largest single classification in the...inventory" (I, 439). As such, the discussion covers a sizeable amount of material, particularly that concerning Ibn al-'Arabī (d. 638/1240) and his legacy, that is ripe for further study. Hüseyin Yılmaz's essay deals with ethics and politics, encompassing works across the genres of Sufism, princely mirrors, and philosophy. The next two contributions from Nükhet Varlık and Aleksandar Shopov consider the topic of medicine. Varlık notes that the medical section of the inventory is one of the longest and immediately follows the religious sciences, suggesting that the subject may have been of special interest to 'Aṭūfī. Shopov's chapter looks at medical matters through writings on agriculture and horticulture, which are welcome topics that deserve more attention in modern Islamic studies. Works on history are examined by Cornell Fleischer and Kaya Şahin, which is particularly valuable given the Ottoman dynasty's well-known penchant for texts chronicling their own past as part of the imperial project.

Pinar Emiralioglu's chapter discusses geography books and the wonders of creation, along with a contextual history of Ottoman interests in geography and cartography. The following essay by Tahera Qutbuddin looks at Arabic philology and literature, a relatively sizeable collection which the author suggests might have been used for teaching. Sooyong Kim's contribution examines Persian poetry, which is very well-represented in 'Aṭūfi's inventory given the Ottoman sultans' noted interest in the genre. Taking into account the Sufi character of much Persian verse, this essay is a relevant companion to the aforementioned chapter authored by Kafadar and Karamustafa. The next two papers also deal with literary matters: Christopher Markiewicz focuses on the scribal arts, which include texts on *inshā'* (epistolography) and *belle-lettres*, while Ferenc Csirkés discusses Turkish/Turkic poetry, Turkish and Persian lexicography, and the use of both languages in the Ottoman context. The following three essays consider aspects of the celestial and occult sciences. The first by Noah Gardiner looks at the genre of occult-related writings specifically, which includes a broad range of topics such as alchemy, geomancy, bibliomancy, and talismans. The chapter by A. Tunç Şen and Cornell Fleischer examines Ottoman interests in astrology and includes the analysis of several almanacs (*taqwīms*) that were not included in 'Aṭūfi's inventory despite clearly being owned by Bayezid II. The final contribution to this subgroup is by five scholars from McGill University in Montreal: Jamil Ragep, Sally Ragep, Sajjad Nikfahm-Khubravan, Fateme Savadi, and Hasan Umut. This chapter looks in depth at the astral sciences (i.e. astronomy and astrology) and related mathematical subjects such as arithmetic, geometry, and music. Elaheh Kheirandish's essay also considers aspects of mathematics, including arithmetic, geometry, optics, and mechanical devices, and is thus a useful complement to the previous work. The final two chapters of Volume I discuss aspects of philosophy. Khaled El-Rouayheb analyses works concerning logic (*manṭiq*) and dialectics (*jadal*) while Dimitri Gutas considers the two branches of *al-ḥikma al-islāmiyya* (Islamic philosophy) and *al-ḥikma al-falsafīyya* (philosophical, or non-Islamic, philosophy).

Scholars of the Ottoman Empire will of course know that several published primary sources exist pertaining to the field that have been key to its development. However, finding a publication that so deeply mines its core text for discussion and presents it to the reader from myriad angles rather than simply offering a facsimile or transcription bereft of analysis or contextualization is very welcome. Indeed, the book's comprehensively cross-disciplinary nature is an impressive achievement and highlights the value of scholars from different fields working together for mutual benefit. The many subjects represented in the inventory, such as philosophy,

medicine, theology, and Sufism, are capably outlined and analyzed. Much exists in these volumes that researchers in these numerous fields will find useful and interesting. However, the work will of course also be valuable to scholars in other subjects not directly represented in 'Aṭūfi's inventory, such as library studies and the history of collections, the history of art and architecture, and women's studies. Supporting material such as a generous number of high-resolution color images (though a list of these illustrations might have been useful), appendices of the works, and related surviving manuscripts as well as the manuscript facsimile provide much additional data for scholars to peruse and unpack. Indeed, the editors have done the field a great service by laying such a substantial, methodical, and insightful foundation for further study.

Those desiring to publish complex primary sources should pay attention to the approach taken by the volume editors, both in terms of the wide-ranging publication itself but also to the preparatory workshop stage. Although access to the necessary resources is unfortunately not equally available across institutions, this publication demonstrates what might be achieved through interdisciplinary collaboration and a sensitivity to the contexts surrounding a primary source and its subject matter. One can only hope that the adverse political climate and the post-pandemic landscape will not significantly impede similar future endeavors.